

## **FM REVIEW 2009-2012 15**

**Comments to Editor:** I recommend major revision. As usual, a split decision, but I think this essay could be publishable with some work.

**Comments to Author:** This is a moving story, but would benefit from significant revision. I agree with reviewer 2 that the part about your father's "calming influence" does not belong in this particular essay which, because of length constraints, is better focused on the treatment issues. Bringing in your current perspective leeches the emotional impact from the story. Similarly, I think the scattered observations you're your perspective as a family doc break the building emotional arc. Consider removing these, and perhaps including a few additional lines from this perspective in the concluding paragraph. Reviewer 1 is correct that the entire essay would benefit from more showing, less telling, and this would be one way to address this concern. Finally, while I concur that the phrase "handed to him on a silver platter" is clichéd and should be changed, the title I believe is an effective and ironic use of this phrase, evoking as it does the violence of Sergio Leone's spaghetti western. I'd leave it.

## **SECOND ROUND**

**Comments to Editor:** The author carefully addressed the concerns of both reviewers and asst editor. In particular, he removed the comments from his current perspective as a physician which both reviewer #2 and I found distracting and weakening the narrative thrust. He also removed a section about the father's calming influence, which was somewhat tangential to the main thrust of the story. Certain cliches were also corrected. As a result, the article is shorter and better focused. It reads well, and tells a poignant story.

**Comments to Author:** Thank you for your attentive consideration of the comments of reviewers and asst editor. The manuscript is much tighter and, in my view, more powerful. The questions in the last paragraph really reverberate, and are an effective way of bringing in your present point of view as a physician without distracting from the narrative of your father.